Edip Yuksel vs. Ali Sina Round 8 Part 32

Edip Yuksel vs. Ali Sina

Round VIII -32

Back < > Next

I can't see how could anyone benefit from fabricating this hadith. The reason that verse was blotted out obviously is the source. This “revelation” came from the martyrs and not God. Obviously the Prophet in his zest to fool his followers, received this revelation from the martyrs telling other Muslims how pleased they are but he forgot that the Quran is supposed to be the word of God and not that of martyrs.

The case of the Satanic Verses were scandalous. In Sura 53:19-22 we read.

19. Have ye seen Lat. and 'Uzza,
20. And another, the third (goddess), Manat?
21. What! for you the male sex, and for Him, the female?
22. Behold, such would be indeed a division most unfair!

But Ibn Sa’d and Tabari, p. 140 report that the verses 21 and 22 were originally the following:

21. These are the exalted Females,
22. And verily their Intercession is to be hoped for.

This open concession and the acceptance of Lat, Ozza and Manat, the three goddesses daughters of Allah, surprised and pleased the Quraish who unanimously bowed in prostration when Muhammad ended his speech with these words: “Wherefore bow down before God, and serve Him.” Quraish were happy and avowed to end hostility.

Some narrators say that on the very night of that day, Gabriel appeared to Muhammad and said: “_What is this that thou hast done? thou hast repeated before the people words that I never gave unto thee.” A_nd Muhammad realizing that these verses were put into his mouth by Satan, retracted from what he said, disowned the whole proceeding, and called those verses “Satanic Verses”.

However, the fact that the tidings of the reconciliation between the Muslims and the Quraish reached Abyssinia and many of the immigrants returned to Mecca makes us deduce that Gabriel did not appear to Muhammad on the same night and this state of peace between the Quraish and the followers of Muhammad went on for a while.

Obviously Edip who is in utter denial of all the history of Islam does not know any of this and I am not holding him accountable of that either. Nonetheless, he must explain the gross

contradictions in the Quran that forced the early scholars to invent an entire “science” called nasekh wa mansookh (the abrogators and the abrogated) just to study which verses are abrogated and by which ones.

Take for example the punishment of the adulterers.

4.15
”If any of your women are guilty of lewdness, Take the evidence of four (Reliable) witnesses from amongst you against them; and if they testify, confine them to houses until death do claim them, or Allah ordain for them some (other) way.
16__. If two men among you are guilty of lewdness, punish them both. If they repent and amend, Leave them alone; for Allah is Oft-returning, Most Merciful.

Now compare that to:

24:2
The woman and the man guilty of adultery or fornication,- flog each of them with a hundred stripes: Let not compassion move you in their case, in a matter prescribed by Allah, if ye believe in Allah and the Last Day: and let a party of the Believers witness their punishment.

Clearly these are two different injunctions?

In the "Dictionary of Qur'anic Terms and Concepts", pages 5, 6, by Muntasir Mir, it says, "Quranic injunctions themselves may be abrogated, as has happened in a few cases. An example of this abrogation is 24:2 which abrogates the punishment of adultery, (q.v.) stated in 4:15-16. A study of the Quran shows first, that only a limited number of Quranic verses have been abrogated, and second, that the abrogation pertains to legal and practical matters only, and not to matters of doctrine and belief."

But the abrogation does not pertain only to legal and practical matters. What about the verse:

5:69 “Those who believe (in the Qur'an), those who follow the Jewish (scriptures), and the Sabians and the Christians,- any who believe in Allah and the Last Day, and work righteousness,- on them shall be no fear, nor shall they grieve.”

Compared to:

49:15 "Only those are Believers who have believed in Allah and His Messenger, and have never since doubted, but have striven with their belongings and their persons in the Cause of Allah: Such are the sincere ones."

or

9:29 “Fight those who do not believe in God and the last day... and fight People of the Book, who do not accept the religion of truth (Islam) until they pay tribute by hand, being inferior"

Are the people of scriptures believers in God or not? Can they live in peace or they should be fought? Can they live without the fear of the Muslims or should they pay tribute for their safety? Are their religions going to be accepted or not? These two verses obviously contradict each other and there are many more. That is why the Islamic scholars studied for years to understand the science of nasekh wa mansookh. If such science exists, it is because some of the scholars saw the discrepancies and tried to make sense of them.

We discussed this pint in round V page 16 too.

Sina wrote:
You seem to have run out of arguments before we even engage and hence with these tedious copy pasting and filibustering tactics you try to bore the readers and find your way out of this discussion. Please prove to us this is not the case.

You made me smile. Thanks. Do you remember the words PROJECTION?

I asked you to please engage in debating with me instead of copy pasting and you wrote

> Copy paste what? So far, I copied and pasted only ONE article of MINE to TRICK you in order to expose the real reason behind your indulgence in loads of trashy hearsays of hearsays of hearsays… You are the one who is continuously copying and pasting the hearsay books and you have the audacity to blame me for what you have been doing since the beginning of our debate. More than half of what you have included in your answers were COPY and PASTE from story books.

You call the hadith and Sira “story books” and dismiss them as fairytales and yet you want us to believe that Islam suddenly fell from the sky and it is irrelevant to know anything about its author and its history. Now isn’t this the most fabulous fairytale of all?